Examining Child Welfare Outcomes for Asian-Canadian Children and Families: A Mixed Methods Study

Barbara Lee
BA, BSW, MSW, RSW, PhD

November 3, 2016

CSWE Transforming Child Welfare Dissertation
Child Welfare Track Meeting
Overview

- Research Background and Rationale
- Methodology
- Research Findings
- Implications for Research, Theory, and Practice
Asian-Canadian Children and Families

East/ Southeast Asian origins

• Chinese
• Filipino
• Indo-Chinese origins
  • Indonesian
  • Japanese
  • Korean
  • Malay
  • Mongolian
  • Taiwanese
  • Tibetan
  • Asian, n.i.e.
  • East/Southeast Asian, n.i.e.

Indo-Chinese origins

• Burmese
• Cambodian
• Laotian
• Thai
• Vietnamese

n.i.e. abbreviation for not included elsewhere.

A Growing Population

- Asians are the largest and fastest growing ethnic minorities in Canada and the US (Statistics Canada, 2010; US Census Bureau, 2010)

- In Canada, the top source country is the Philippines (13.1%) followed by China (10.4%) (National Household Survey, 2011)

- Diversity in backgrounds and needs

*Note:* The year 2006 was the last Canadian Census that included data regarding immigration and ethno-cultural diversity. The Statistics Canada long-form questionnaire was replaced in 2011 by the National Household Survey to collect data regarding immigration and ethno-cultural diversity.
Gaps in Child Welfare Research and Knowledge

- Very **little attention** has been given to Asian children and families involved in the child welfare system and social services (Behl, Crouch, May, Valente, & Conyngham, 2001; Fong & Mokuau, 1994)

- **Ignores the real and relevant issues** in the Asian communities (Kim & Keefe, 2010; Leong & Lau, 2001)

- Understanding Asian children and families is important in **preventing harm and supporting well-being**
Theoretical Frameworks

- Decision-making Ecology  
  (Baumann, Dalgleish, Fluke, & Kern, 2011; Baumann, Kern, & Fluke, 1997)

- General Assessment and Decision-making Model  
  (Delgleish, 2003, 2006)

- Culture and Child Maltreatment Decision-Making Model  
  (Terao, Borrego, & Urquiza, 2001)

- Theoretical Framework of Child Maltreatment Among Asian Americans  
  (Zhai & Gao, 2009)
Child Welfare Concepts

Disproportionality


Disparity

Mix Methods Research Design

* Trocmé, Fallon, MacLaurin, Sinha, Black, et al. (2008)
** Trocmé, Fallon, Shlonsky
Asian-Canadian Households are Under-represented Compared to White-Canadian Households in the Child Welfare System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Canadian Child Population&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Child Maltreatment Investigations in CIS-2008&lt;sup&gt;d&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Rate per 1,000&lt;sup&gt;e&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Children&lt;16</td>
<td>6,022,005</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>221,560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian-Canadian&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>430,072</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>5,988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White-Canadian&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>4,245,555</td>
<td>70.5</td>
<td>153,337</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup> Asian-Canadian refers to visible minority populations including Chinese, Filipino, Southeast Asian, Korean, and Japanese based on the Census definitions (Statistics Canada catalogue no. 97-562-XCB2006008).

<sup>b</sup> White-Canadian refers to “not a visible minority” and excludes Aboriginal populations based on the Census definitions (Statistics Canada catalogue no. 97-562-XCB2006008 and Statistics Canada catalogue no. 97-558-XCB2006013).

<sup>c</sup> Estimate based on the 2006 Census of Population for children 15 years and under (Statistics Canada catalogue no. 97-551-XCB2006011).

<sup>d</sup> Estimate based on CIS-2008 all of Canada weighted sample for children 15 years and under.

<sup>e</sup> Rate of child maltreatment investigations in the Canadian child welfare system per 1000 children in population.
“…[Asian] family and children are not encouraged to speak about private family matters so then the only time we do get involved is when an incident has already happened. So we are not getting in at the early help stages.”
Substantiated Investigations involving Physical Abuse for Asian-Canadian vs. White-Canadian Households

- **Population-Based Disparity Ratio (PDI)**: Census Child Population = 0.92
- **Decision-Based Disparity Ratio (DDI)**: Investigations in Child Welfare = 2.36
- **Maltreatment-Based Disparity Ratio (MDI)**: Physical Abuse Investigations in Child Welfare = 1.26
## Asian-Canadian Households More Likely to Close After Investigation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Logistic Regression</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Model 1:</strong> Asian Ethnicity</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Model 3:</strong> Asian Ethnicity +</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Demographic &amp;</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Composition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Model 5:</strong> Asian Ethnicity +</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Characteristics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Model 7:</strong> Asian Ethnicity +</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical Concerns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Final Model</strong></td>
<td>1.99</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CIS-2008 (N=3,202)
FOCUS GROUP THEME:
Child Welfare Service Should be Based on the Client’s Need

“We’re not transferring them to ongoing service because we don’t have a full depth and breadth of understanding of the family. To me, that’s about language barriers and cultural barriers.”
Asian Children and Families Received Ongoing CPS for Longer

OCANDS (N=1,988)

Asian

- Median Days = 339

White

- Median Days = 301
Asian Households Less Likely to be Re-Investigated

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Logistic Regression</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model 1: Asian Ethnicity</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model 3: Asian Ethnicity + Child Demographic &amp; Household Composition</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model 5: Asian Ethnicity + Case Characteristics</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model 7: Asian Ethnicity + Clinical Concerns</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final Model</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>&lt;0.001***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OCANDS (N=6,675)
Research Summary

- Asian families are disproportionately under-represented in the child welfare system

- **Disparities** in child welfare involvement between Asian and White children and families along the continuum of child welfare services and decisions

- Child welfare workers and community service professionals provided **cultural and structural context** for child welfare services and decisions
Limitations

- Examined only child maltreatment investigations
- Asian category
  - Immigration status not available
- Key factors not available
  - Community characteristics
  - Organizational factors
  - Poverty
- Missing are the voices and perspectives of caregivers, children, other professionals
Implications and Recommendations

Research

1. More research on Asian population in child welfare
2. Available data regarding ethnicity, race, and immigration
3. Ethno-racial categories need to be defined
4. Available discrete categories of Asian groups
5. Consider individual, organizational, and external factors
6. Use advanced statistical strategies
7. Qualitative or mixed methods, and with different perspectives
Implications and Recommendations

Theory

1. PDI and DDI should be presented together
2. MDI should be used for populations with predominant specific maltreatment concern
3. *Child Maltreatment Decision-making Model* should also consider maltreatment type and severity
4. The *Decision-making Ecology* can be strengthened by considering client factors
5. Longitudinal perspectives should be considered in theory development
Implications and Recommendations

Practice

1. Evidence-informed practices are needed
2. Attention to mental health concerns among Asian-Canadian children and families
3. Community engagement and outreach with Asian communities
4. Cross-cultural training for child welfare workers to promote cultural sensitivity and awareness in organizations
References

Acknowledgements

Thesis Supervisor:
  Dr. Esme Fuller-Thomson (University of Toronto)

Thesis Committee Members:
  Dr. Barbara Fallon (University of Toronto)
  Dr. Nico Trocmé (McGill University)
  Dr. Tara Black (University of Toronto)

Thesis Appraisers:
  Dr. Bryn King (University of Toronto)
  Dr. Alan Leschied (Western University)
Thank You!

Barbara Lee
Factor-Inwentash Faculty of Social Work
University of Toronto
(email: barbara.lee@utoronto.ca)

School of Social Work
Carleton University
(email: barbara.lee@carleton.ca)

School of Social Work
University of British Columbia
(Effective May 1, 2017)
Dissertation Publications